

## Analytical Table of Contents

Questions 90–97 are included here in full. Since this is an analytical table of contents, I have superimposed an outline format to show more clearly the place of each section in the whole. Sometimes St. Thomas phrases his section titles differently in his prologues than before the sections themselves; for clarity here, I have sometimes combined them. The various brief “Before Reading” sections are my own, distinct from the sections of commentary devoted to St. Thomas’s various Prologues. Although the *Commentary* is self-contained, the *Companion to the Commentary*, an online book available via the Resources link at the *Commentary*’s catalogue webpage (<http://UndergroundThomist.org>), provides both additional commentary on brief selections from Questions 98–108 and additional discussion of various themes in each Prologue and Article, for readers who want to understand the *Treatise* in still greater depth. Topics covered in the *Companion* are listed immediately after this analytical table of contents.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02939-2 - Commentary on Thomas Aquinas's: Treatise on Law

J. Budziszewski

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii

*Analytical Table of Contents*

<i>Contents of the Online Companion to the Commentary</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
<i>St. Thomas's Prayer Ante Studium ("Before Study")</i>	xvii
<i>Diagram of the Architecture of Law</i>	xviii
<i>Introduction</i>	xix
I. LAW ITSELF, IN GENERAL (QUESTIONS 90–92, ALL INCLUDED IN THIS COMMENTARY)	I
<i>Before Reading Question 90</i>	I
<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Questions 90–92</i>	5
A. The essence of law (Question 90)	5
1. <i>Whether law is something pertaining to reason? (Question 90, Article 1)</i>	12
2. <i>Concerning the end of law – in particular, whether the law is always something directed to the common good? (Question 90, Article 2)</i>	27
3. <i>Concerning its cause – in particular, whether the reason of any man is competent to make laws? (Question 90, Article 3)</i>	39
4. <i>Concerning its promulgation – in particular, whether promulgation is essential to a law? (Question 90, Article 4)</i>	49
<i>Before Reading Question 91</i>	57
<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 91</i>	59
B. The different kinds of law (Question 91)	59
1. <i>Whether there is an eternal law? (Question 91, Article 1)</i>	61
2. <i>Whether there is a natural law? (Question 91, Article 2)</i>	71
3. <i>Whether there is a human law? (Question 91, Article 3)</i>	85
4. <i>Whether there is a Divine law? (Question 91, Article 4)</i>	95
5. <i>Whether there is one Divine law, or several? (Question 91, Article 5)</i>	111
6. <i>Whether there is a law of sin? (Question 91, Article 6)</i>	123
<i>Before reading Question 92</i>	136
<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 92</i>	137
C. The effects of law (Question 92)	137
1. <i>Whether an effect of law is to make men good? (Question 92, Article 1)</i>	138
2. <i>Whether the effects of law are to command, to forbid, to permit, and to punish, as the Jurist states? (Question 92, Article 2)</i>	149

*Analytical Table of Contents*

ix

II. THE PARTS OF LAW (QUESTIONS 93–108; THIS COMMENTARY INCLUDES QUESTIONS 93–97, AND THE ONLINE COMPANION TO THE COMMENTARY INCLUDES ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY ON EXCERPTS FROM QUESTIONS 97–108)	159
<i>Before Reading Question 93</i>	159
<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Questions 93–108</i>	163
A. Of the eternal law (Question 93)	163
1. <i>What is the eternal law – in particular, whether the eternal law is a sovereign type [ratio] existing in God? (Question 93, Article 1)</i>	164
2. <i>Whether the eternal law is known to all? (Question 93, Article 2)</i>	174
3. <i>Whether every law is derived from the eternal law? (Question 93, Article 3)</i>	182
4. <i>Whether necessary and eternal things are subject to the eternal law? (Question 93, Article 4)</i>	191
5. <i>Whether natural contingents are subject to the eternal law? (Question 93, Article 5)</i>	201
6. <i>Whether all human affairs are subject to the eternal law? (Question 93, Article 6)</i>	211
<i>Before Reading Question 94</i>	224
<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 94</i>	228
B. Of the natural law (Question 94)	228
1. <i>What is the natural law – in particular, whether it is a habit? (Question 94, Article 1)</i>	229
2. <i>What are the precepts of the natural law – in particular, whether it contains several precepts, or only one? (Question 94, Article 2)</i>	237
3. <i>Whether all acts of virtue are prescribed by the natural law? (Question 94, Article 3)</i>	256
4. <i>Whether the natural law is the same in all men? (Question 94, Article 4)</i>	263
5. <i>Whether the natural law can be changed? (Question 94, Article 5)</i>	277
6. <i>Whether the natural law can be abolished from the heart of man? (Question 94, Article 6)</i>	290
<i>Before Reading Question 95</i>	299
<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 95</i>	300

x	<i>Analytical Table of Contents</i>	
C.	Of human law (Questions 95–97)	300
1.	Considered in itself (Question 95)	300
a.	<i>Its utility: Whether it was useful for laws to be framed by men?</i> (Question 95, Article 1)	302
b.	<i>Its origin: Whether every human law is derived from the natural law?</i> (Question 95, Article 2)	311
c.	<i>Its quality: Whether Isidore's description of the quality of positive law is appropriate?</i> (Question 95, Article 3)	322
d.	<i>Its division: Whether Isidore's division of human laws is appropriate?</i> (Question 95, Article 4)	332
	<i>Before Reading Question 96</i>	346
	<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 96</i>	348
2.	<i>Its power</i> (Question 96)	348
a.	<i>Whether human law should be framed for the community rather than the individual?</i> (Question 96, Article 1)	349
b.	<i>Whether human law should repress all vices?</i> (Question 96, Article 2)	359
c.	<i>Whether human law is competent to direct all acts of virtue?</i> (Question 96, Article 3)	371
d.	<i>Whether it binds a man in conscience?</i> (Question 96, Article 4)	379
e.	<i>Whether all men are subject to human laws?</i> (Question 96, Article 5)	393
f.	<i>Whether those who are under the law may act beside the letter of the law?</i> (Question 96, Article 6)	406
	<i>Before Reading Question 97</i>	418
	<i>St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 97</i>	420
3.	<i>Its mutability</i> (Question 97)	420
a.	<i>Whether human law is changeable?</i> (Question 97, Article 1)	421
b.	<i>Whether it should be always changed, whenever anything better occurs?</i> (Question 97, Article 2)	429
c.	<i>Whether it is abolished by custom, and whether custom obtains the force of law?</i> (Question 97, Article 3)	436
d.	<i>Whether the application of human law should be changed by dispensation of those in authority?</i> (Question 97, Article 4)	449
	<i>Index</i>	461

## Contents of the Online *Companion to the Commentary*

### I. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY

The Context of the Selections from Questions 98–108	1
Before Reading the Selections	4
Commentary on St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 100: Of the Moral Precepts of the Old Law	6
Commentary on Question 100, Article 1: Whether All the Moral Precepts of the Old Law Belong to the Law of Nature?	12
Commentary on Question 100, Article 8: Whether the Precepts of the Decalogue Are Dispensable?	24
Commentary on St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 105: Of the Reason for the Judicial Precepts	39
Commentary on Question 105, Article 1: Whether the Old Law Enjoined Fitting Precepts Concerning Rulers?	40
Commentary on St. Thomas's Prologue to Question 106: Of the Law of the Gospel, Called the New Law, Considered in Itself	60
Commentary on Question 106, Article 1: Whether the New Law Is a Written Law?	62

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02939-2 - Commentary on Thomas Aquinas's: Treatise on Law

J. Budziszewski

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## xii Contents of the Online Companion to the Commentary

## II. ADDITIONAL TOPICS EXPLORED

Question 90	74
<i>The architecture of law</i>	74
<i>The “dialectical” movement of Question 90</i>	76
<i>What is the common good, anyway?</i>	78
<i>Do-it-yourself lawmaking</i>	83
<i>Secret laws, vague laws, and other failures of promulgation</i>	85
Question 91	90
<i>Are these the only kinds of law there are?</i>	90
<i>Does the eternal lawmaker really exist?</i>	91
<i>If the natural law is really natural, why bring God into it?</i>	97
<i>Why not base human law on a social contract?</i>	99
<i>The relation between natural and Divine law</i>	103
<i>Revelation – says who?</i>	106
<i>The architecture of law, revisited</i>	108
Question 92	111
<i>The elemental operations of law</i>	111
<i>Making men good</i>	112
<i>Is there anything law may not command?</i>	113
Question 93	116
<i>Eternal law, original justice, and original sin</i>	116
<i>God as the originator of reality; truth as correspondence with reality</i>	119
<i>How the finite intellect knows what it knows</i>	121
<i>Law and the “appearance of law”</i>	123
<i>Could God have created a different nature?</i>	125
<i>Two ways of imposing order</i>	129
<i>The “inward motive principle”</i>	131
<i>The indestructibility of the good of nature</i>	132
Question 94	136
<i>The organization of Question 94</i>	136
<i>Natural laws and natural rights</i>	136
<b>Conscience, conscience, and conscience</b>	141
<i>The natural inclinations</i>	144
<i>The ruling and subordinate powers of the soul</i>	146
<i>Just be reasonable?</i>	149
<i>So-called virtue ethics</i>	151
<i>The problem of common ground</i>	152
<i>Are natural rights more “evident” than natural duties?</i>	154
<i>The case of the German tribes: Is it possible not to know that theft is wrong?</i>	155
<i>Inventions, innovations, and nature</i>	159

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02939-2 - Commentary on Thomas Aquinas's: Treatise on Law

J. Budziszewski

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents of the Online Companion to the Commentary</i>	xiii
<i>The problem of slavery</i>	160
<i>Do even sociopaths and psychopaths know the natural law?</i>	166
<i>Is every apparent case of moral ignorance a real one?</i>	169
Question 95	171
<i>Are we co-legislators with God?</i>	171
<i>The futility of anarchism</i>	172
<i>Discerning the reasons for the laws</i>	173
<i>Rationality is not the same as rationalism</i>	176
<i>Why does classification matter?</i>	177
Question 96	179
<i>Why just these questions?</i>	179
<i>Legal "privileges"</i>	180
<i>What counts as harm to others?</i>	181
<i>The need and the burden of prudence</i>	183
<i>Shared private goods</i>	186
<i>The problem of toleration</i>	187
<i>Conscience, conscience, and conscience, revisited</i>	189
<i>Inviolability of conscience</i>	190
<i>Conscientious disobedience to unjust laws</i>	192
<i>Conscientious resistance to unjust governments</i>	195
<i>Are there specific "rights of conscience"?</i>	198
<i>Legal "privileges," revisited</i>	201
<i>More difficult examples</i>	204
<i>Equality of justice</i>	208
Question 97	210
<i>Why not skip Article 1?</i>	210
<i>Shielding laws from change</i>	210
<i>Prototype of a radical reformer</i>	214
<i>The continuing vitality of St. Thomas's view of custom</i>	216
<i>The use and abuse of dispensation</i>	218
Question 100	221
<i>The moral architecture of the Old Law</i>	221
<i>The Two Great Commandments</i>	221
<i>The Decalogue</i>	222
<i>The rest of the moral precepts</i>	224
<i>Does what holds for the Old Law hold for the New Law too?</i>	225
<i>Why is Divine instruction needed?</i>	226
<i>False difficulties</i>	228
<i>Real difficulties</i>	229
Question 105	232
<i>Why Article 1 is important even for secular readers</i>	232
<i>What St. Thomas really means by kingship</i>	233
<i>Background on the peril of tyranny</i>	235

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02939-2 - Commentary on Thomas Aquinas's: Treatise on Law

J. Budziszewski

Table of Contents

[More information](#)xiv      *Contents of the Online Companion to the Commentary*

Question 106	236
<i>The relevance of the gospel to philosophy</i>	236
<i>The relation between nature and grace</i>	237
<i>Implications of St. Thomas's teaching for the present world</i>	237